

JUSTICE FIRST, LLP
Jenny C. Huang, SBN 223596
2831 Telegraph Avenue
Oakland, CA 94609
Telephone: (510) 628-0695
Fax: (510) 272-0711
E-mail: jhuang@justicefirstllp.com

JUSTICE FIRST, LLP
Sarita I. Ordóñez, SBN 216047
P.O. Box 181
Imperial Beach, CA 91933-0181
Telephone: (510) 628-0695
Fax: (510) 272-0711
E-mail: sordonez@justicefirstllp.com

JIVAKA CANDAPPA, SBN 225919
5111 Telegraph Avenue, #215
Oakland, CA 94609
Telephone: (510) 654-4129
Fax: (510) 594-9610
E-mail: jcandappa@sbcglobal.net

Attorneys for Plaintiff Abhinav Bhatnagar

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

ABHINAV BHATNAGAR,)
Plaintiff,) Case No.: Case No. CV07-02669 (CRB)
vs.)
)
JASON INGRASSIA, individually and in)
his official capacity; COUNTY OF)
CONTRA COSTA; and CITY OF)
SAN RAMON.)
Defendants.) Date: December 7, 2007
) Time: 10:00am
) Honorable Charles R. Breyer
)
)

**MEMORANDUM OF POINTS AND AUTHORITIES IN SUPPORT OF
PLAINTIFF'S MOTION FOR A PROTECTIVE ORDER
PURSUANT TO FED. R. CIV. PRO. 26(c)**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<u>Page(s)</u>
TABLE OF CONTENTS.....	ii
TABLE OF AUTHORITIES	iii
SUMMARY OF ARGUMENT	1-2
STATEMENT OF FACTS	2-7
ARGUMENT	8-15
I. PURSUANT TO FED. R. CIV. PRO. 26(c), PLAINTIFF HAS GOOD CAUSE FOR ISSUANCE OF A PROTECTIVE ORDER TO PROHIBIT DEFENDANT INGRASSIA FROM ATTENDING THE DEPOSITION OF PLAINTIFF'S WITNESS	8-15
A. Plaintiff Will Be Severely Prejudiced in the Event that this Motion is Denied.....	9-13
B. Any Legitimate Interest That Defendant Ingrassia May Have in Attending the Deposition of Mr. Ha is Outweighed by the Prejudicial Impact on Plaintiff	13-15
CONCLUSION.....	15

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

<u>Federal Cases:</u>	<u>Page(s)</u>
<i>Beacon v. R.M. Jones Rentals</i> (N.D. Ohio 1978) 79 F.R.D. 141.....	8
<i>Dart Industries Co. v. Westwood Chemical Co.</i> (9 th Cir. 1980) 649 F.2d 646	15
<i>Galella v. Onassis</i> (2 nd Cir. 1973) 487 F.2d 986	8, 9, 14
<i>Hines v. Wilkinson</i> (S.D. Ohio 1995) 163 F.R.D. 262	9
<i>In re Shell Oil Refinery</i> (E.D. La. 1991) 136 F.R.D. 615	8, 10-11
<i>Lee v. Denver Sheriff's Dept. et.al</i> (Dist. Colo. 1998) 181 F.R.D. 651.....	9
<i>M&M Medical Supplies & Serv., Inc. v. Pleasant Valley Hosp., Inc.</i> (4th Cir. 1992) 981 F.2d 160.....	14-15
<i>Phillips ex rel. Estates of Byrd v. General Motors Corp.</i> (9th Cir. 2002) 307 F.3d 1206	9, 13
<i>Rivera v. NIBCO, Inc.</i> (9 th Cir. 2004) 364 F.3d 1057	9, 13
<i>Seattle Times Co. v. Rhinehart</i> (1984) 467 U.S. 20.....	8
 <u>Federal Statutes:</u>	
Fed. R. Civ. Pro., Rule 26(c).....	<i>passim</i>